

## **Ans 1**

Grade: 3 (A partially successful response)

### **Justification:**

**Relevance and Understanding:** The student's response shows an understanding of the discussion topic and aligns with Karen's perspective on the importance of individual actions in combating climate change. The student attempts to build on Karen's argument by adding an explanation of the potential impact on global CO2 levels and temperatures. However, the extension is somewhat superficial and lacks depth.

**Elaboration and Clarity:** The student mentions additional points about the role of industries and their environmental impact, which tries to balance the debate between individual actions and systemic changes. However, the elaboration on how individual actions can significantly impact the planet is limited and could be clearer. The response could benefit from more detailed examples or a more thorough explanation of the mechanisms by which individual actions contribute to broader environmental goals.

**Syntactic Structure and Vocabulary:** The response uses a simple range of syntactic structures and vocabulary. There is some attempt to vary sentence structure, but the language used is relatively basic and could be more varied to better convey complex ideas.

**Grammar and Lexical Accuracy:** There are grammatical issues, such as awkward phrasing ("by doing jobs mentioned by her," "consists with lots of semiconductor firms," "most of them are fusil fuels"), and some incorrect word choices ("fusil" instead of "fossil"). These errors detract from the clarity and professionalism of the response.

**Originality and Coherence:** The student's original contributions, like the mention of specific industry impacts, add some value to the discussion but are not fully developed or coherently integrated into the argument. The response could benefit from more original analysis and less reliance on reiterated points from the class discussion.

### Suggestions for Improvement:

The student could improve the response by providing more detailed explanations and examples of how individual actions can have a meaningful impact on climate change, such as citing studies or statistics.

Enhancing the discussion of systemic changes and integrating this with the argument for individual responsibility would provide a more balanced and in-depth perspective.

Addressing grammatical errors and using more precise and varied vocabulary would also enhance the clarity and effectiveness of the response.

A (Original Writing)	B (Improvement in Topic Development)	C (Improvement in Language Use)	D (Ideal Response Example)
I agree with Karen.	This sentence could provide a brief rationale for agreeing with Karen, making the introduction more engaging.		"I agree with Karen because her emphasis on individual responsibility highlights a crucial aspect of tackling climate change."
Karen stated that the individual lifestyle has a impact on fighting climate change.	The student could elaborate on how individual choices impact climate change, using specific examples or data.	Adjust for grammatical accuracy: "has an impact" instead of "has a impact".	"Karen correctly noted that individual lifestyle choices significantly impact our fight against climate change, especially through reduced energy consumption and waste."
She points out that by conserving energy, reducing any type of waste, and adopting sustainable habits can make a change to climate change.	The sentence could be improved by explaining how these actions contribute to the broader environmental impact.	The sentence structure needs to be corrected for clarity: "She points out that conserving energy, reducing waste, and adopting sustainable habits can contribute	"She highlights that actions such as conserving energy, minimizing waste, and adopting sustainable habits directly contribute to lowering global carbon emissions."

		to mitigating climate change."	
However, she didn't mention on how it would impact the planet, therefore I would add that by doing jobs mentioned by her, we can lower the unnecessary CO2 produced, and at the end of the day, lower the average global temperature.	This could be expanded to include specific examples or mechanisms by which these actions lower CO2 levels and global temperatures.	Correct grammatical errors and clarify: "However, she didn't mention how these actions impact the planet; therefore, I would add that by adopting the practices she mentioned, we can reduce unnecessary CO2 emissions and ultimately lower the average global temperature."	"However, she didn't specify the global impact, which is crucial. By adopting these practices, we not only reduce unnecessary CO2 emissions but also contribute to a significant decrease in the average global temperature."
Brad mentioned that changes and government policies are crucial to combat with climate change,	The student could contrast this view more clearly with Karen's by discussing the limitations of relying solely on government policies.	Correct the phrase to "crucial to combating climate change".	"Brad argues that systemic changes and government policies are essential in combating climate change, underscoring the need for large-scale transformations that go beyond individual efforts."
but I think he should add more points on how industries produce wasteful products that impact our climate.	This sentence could provide specific examples of industrial practices that are harmful to the climate.	Improve sentence flow and clarity: "but I think he should elaborate on how industries contribute to climate change by	"However, he could enhance his argument by detailing how specific industrial practices, such as excessive packaging and reliance on fossil fuels, exacerbate climate issues."

		producing wasteful products."	
For example, for a country consists with lots of semiconductor firms, they use lots and lots of energy and most of them are fossil fuels, making the matters worse.	Clarify and expand on the connection between semiconductor firms, energy use, and climate change, possibly adding data or studies.	Correct grammatical and factual inaccuracies: "For example, in a country with many semiconductor firms, they consume a great deal of energy, predominantly from fossil fuels, exacerbating climate issues."	"For instance, in countries hosting numerous semiconductor firms, these entities consume vast amounts of energy, primarily sourced from fossil fuels, significantly worsening our climate crisis."

## **Ans 2**

Grade: 3 (A partially successful response)

### **Justification:**

**Relevance and Understanding:** The student acknowledges the positions of both Karen and Brad, aligning more closely with Brad's emphasis on genetics. The response effectively integrates a personal anecdote to support the genetic argument but lacks a clear connection to broader research and fails to critically analyze the depth of the debate.

**Elaboration and Clarity:** The student's elaboration on the genetic impact on knowledge across subjects like math and science is relevant but not sufficiently detailed or cited. The personal anecdote about twins provides a strong narrative element but is presented without examining potential confounding factors or deeper analysis.

**Syntactic Structure and Vocabulary:** The response demonstrates a basic command of sentence structure, though the language remains simple and could benefit from more sophistication to better express complex scientific ideas.

**Grammar and Lexical Accuracy:** The response includes some grammatical errors and awkward phrasing, impacting clarity and professionalism.

**Originality and Coherence:** The response shows originality in using a personal anecdote, but the discussion could be more coherent if it included a clearer link between the anecdote, the cited study, and the broader debate.

<b>A (Original Writing)</b>	<b>B (Improvement in Topic Development)</b>	<b>C (Improvement in Language Use)</b>	<b>D (Ideal Response Example)</b>
Karen pointed out that both genetics and environmental factors shape human behaviors.	This sentence can be expanded to summarize Karen's argument more comprehensively, highlighting the interaction between genetics and environment.	This sentence is grammatically correct.	"Karen emphasized the intricate interplay between genetics and environmental factors in shaping human behavior, suggesting a balanced perspective in the nature versus nurture debate."
I would critic that recently there's a study on how genetics impact your knowledge on different subjects, including math, science and more.	Provide a clearer reference to the study, possibly including author, year, or key findings to strengthen the argument.	Correct the phrasing: "I would critique this by citing a recent study that explores how genetics influence proficiency in subjects like math and science."	"A recent study I reviewed illustrates how genetics significantly influence abilities in various academic areas such as mathematics and sciences, suggesting a strong genetic component in educational achievement."
It shows that there's significant impact by genes, and the environment only plays a small role on that.	Elaborate on the study's methodology or findings to bolster the argument about the relative impact of genes versus environment.	Correct grammatical errors and improve clarity: "It shows a significant impact from genes, with the environment playing only a minor role."	"The study demonstrates that genetic factors have a pronounced impact, while environmental influences appear to play a lesser role, thus supporting a genetically-oriented view in the nature versus nurture debate."
Therefore I agree with Brad that there's more considerable impact by genes compared to nurture.	This conclusion could be strengthened by a more detailed comparison of evidence supporting both genetic and environmental influences.	Improve the formal tone and clarity: "Therefore, I find myself agreeing with Brad that genetic factors generally have a more substantial influence than environmental factors."	"Given the compelling evidence from recent studies, I concur with Brad that genetics often have a more profound impact on human development than environmental conditions."
From my experience, I've twins that have been separated from their family since they were born.	Introduce the anecdote more smoothly and explain its relevance to the debate more clearly.	Improve grammatical accuracy: "From my own experience, I know twins who have been separated from their birth family."	"Drawing from personal experience, I know of twins who were separated at birth and raised in distinctly different environments."

Even though they have different families, they are both good at the same subject, in this case, they are both good at computer science, and planning to pursue on computer science degree.	Discuss how this anecdote illustrates genetic influence despite different nurturing environments, and potentially relate back to broader research findings.	Correct grammatical and phrasing errors: "Despite having been raised in different families, both excel at the same subject—computer science—and both plan to pursue degrees in this field."	"Despite their differing upbringings, both twins excel in computer science, which suggests a genetic predisposition towards this field, reinforcing the argument for genetic influence."
From this experience, because they both have similar genes, therefore I agree more with Brad.	Clarify the logical connection between the anecdote and the broader debate on nature versus nurture.	Refine phrasing for clarity and grammatic correctness: "This experience, showing similar genetic potential despite different environments, further aligns me with Brad's perspective."	"This experience underscores the strong influence of genetics, as both twins exhibit similar talents despite their different environments, compelling me to agree more with Brad's emphasis on genetic factors."

### **Ans 3**

Grade: 3 (A partially successful response)

#### **Justification:**

Relevance and Understanding: The student recognizes the importance of both viewpoints but aligns with Karen's argument about prioritizing technological advancements. The response correctly captures the fundamental debate but could benefit from more depth in explaining how advancements in technology can directly enhance social welfare programs.

Elaboration and Clarity: The student attempts to support their argument using hypothetical scenarios to show the implications of lacking advanced technology. However, these scenarios are somewhat simplistic and need more detailed explanation or evidence to be truly convincing.

Syntactic Structure and Vocabulary: The response shows a reasonable range of sentence structures but the vocabulary remains simple and could better express the complexities of policy-making and its impacts.

Grammar and Lexical Accuracy: The response includes grammatical errors and awkward constructions that impact the clarity of the argument.

Originality and Coherence: The response is original, particularly in using a hypothetical scenario to support the argument. However, the coherence of the argument could be improved by more closely connecting technological advancements to specific improvements in social welfare.



<b>A (Original Writing)</b>	<b>B (Improvement in Topic Development)</b>	<b>C (Improvement in Language Use)</b>	<b>D (Ideal Response Example)</b>
I agree with Karen.	Begin with a brief summary of Karen's argument to establish context before stating agreement.	This sentence is grammatically correct.	"I agree with Karen's viewpoint that prioritizing scientific research can lead to significant societal benefits."
Brad pointed out that social welfare programs were the fundamental of environment for scientific research, but in reality, it is completely otherwise.	Clarify and expand on how technological advancements could enhance or even necessitate effective social welfare programs.	Clarify and correct the sentence for better flow and accuracy: "Brad argued that social welfare programs are foundational for scientific research, but in reality, the opposite is often true."	"Brad argued that social welfare programs are essential for fostering an environment conducive to scientific research; however, technological advancements themselves often create the conditions necessary for effective welfare programs."
Imagine living in a world with less advanced technologies, maybe cellphones aren't even invented yet.	Provide a more detailed and realistic scenario that connects directly to the impact of technological advancements on social welfare.	Correct slight awkwardness and improve clarity: "Imagine a world with less advanced technology, where even cellphones haven't been invented."	"Imagine a world without modern technology; for instance, where cellphones are non-existent. This lack of technology would significantly hinder communication and the effective distribution of social services."
People will have no ways to communicate, making social welfare programs harder to distribute because the government simply can't figure out who is the person that needed the most help.	Expand on other ways technology supports social welfare beyond communication, such as data analysis and service delivery.	Improve grammatical structure: "People would have no way to communicate, making it harder to distribute social welfare programs because the government would struggle to identify those most in need of help."	"Without advanced communication technologies, governments would struggle to identify and reach individuals most in need, significantly hampering the effectiveness of social welfare programs."
Furthermore, modern day AI technology breakthroughs may be non existence.	Discuss specific AI technologies and how they currently enhance social welfare programs.	Correct grammatical errors: "Furthermore, modern AI technology breakthroughs might not exist."	"Furthermore, without investment in scientific research, breakthroughs in AI technology, which currently enhance various social welfare programs, might never occur."

Therefore, Karen's statement was better, because with new technologies, people will be able to help each other more easily.	Explain how specific technologies facilitate better social support systems.	Improve phrasing for clarity and grammatical accuracy: "Therefore, Karen's argument holds more weight because new technologies enable more effective mutual aid among people."	"Therefore, Karen's argument is compelling because advancements in technology, such as mobile apps for emergency services and online educational platforms, significantly enhance our ability to support one another effectively."
For example, for those who can't understand basic languages, we can help them by using artificial intelligence tools, closing the gap between the people that needed help, and normal individuals.	Use a real-world example of AI aiding in language translation to demonstrate tangible benefits.	Correct grammatical errors and clarify the example: "For instance, artificial intelligence tools can assist those who struggle with language barriers, bridging the gap between those in need of help and the broader community."	"For example, AI-powered translation tools are already assisting individuals who face language barriers, effectively bridging the gap between those in need and the available services, thus enhancing social inclusivity."